

---

**Personal Data-Smart Cities:  
How Cities Can Utilise Their  
Citizen's Personal Data to Help  
Them Become Climate Neutral**

---

# RIVER PUBLISHERS SERIES IN ENERGY SUSTAINABILITY AND EFFICIENCY

---

*Series Editor*

## **PEDRAM ASEF**

*Lecturer (Asst. Prof.) in Automotive Engineering,  
University of Hertfordshire,  
UK*

The “River Publishers Series in Energy Sustainability and Efficiency” is a series of comprehensive academic and professional books which focus on theory and applications in sustainable and efficient energy solutions. The books serve as a multi-disciplinary resource linking sustainable energy and society, fulfilling the rapidly growing worldwide interest in energy solutions. All fields of possible sustainable energy solutions and applications are addressed, not only from a technical point of view, but also from economic, social, political, and financial aspects. Books published in the series include research monographs, edited volumes, handbooks and textbooks. They provide professionals, researchers, educators, and advanced students in the field with an invaluable insight into the latest research and developments.

Topics covered in the series include, but are not limited to:

- Sustainable energy development and management;
- Alternate and renewable energies;
- Energy conservation;
- Energy efficiency;
- Carbon reduction;
- Environment.

For a list of other books in this series, visit [www.riverpublishers.com](http://www.riverpublishers.com)

---

# **Personal Data-Smart Cities: How Cities Can Utilise Their Citizen's Personal Data to Help Them Become Climate Neutral**

---

**Editors**

**Shaun Topham**

DataVaults Project, Ireland

**Paolo Boscolo**

Comune of Prato and Major Cities of Europe

**Michael Mulquin**

Open and Agile Smart Cities



**River Publishers**

*Published, sold and distributed by:*

River Publishers

Alsbjergvej 10

9260 Gistrup

Denmark

[www.riverpublishers.com](http://www.riverpublishers.com)

ISBN: 978-87-7022-800-8 (Hardback)

978-87-7022-799-5 (Ebook)

The cover design is based upon the graphic recordings produced by Agata Smok, during the EU Smart Cities MarketPlace Action Cluster meetings.

©2021 *Graphic recording by Agata Smok for DG ENER*

<https://smart-cities-marketplace.ec.europa.eu/>

©The Editor(s) (if applicable) and The Author(s) 2022. This book is published open access.

### **Open Access**

This book is distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-Non-Commercial 4.0 International License, CC-BY-NC 4.0) (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>), which permits use, duplication, adaptation, distribution and reproduction in any medium or format, as long as you give appropriate credit to the original author(s) and the source, a link is provided to the Creative Commons license and any changes made are indicated. The images or other third party material in this book are included in the work's Creative Commons license, unless indicated otherwise in the credit line; if such material is not included in the work's Creative Commons license and the respective action is not permitted by statutory regulation, users will need to obtain permission from the license holder to duplicate, adapt, or reproduce the material.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

The publisher, the authors and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, express or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made.

Printed on acid-free paper.

---

# Contents

---

<b>Foreword</b>	<b>xiii</b>
<b>Preface</b>	<b>xv</b>
<b>Acknowledgements</b>	<b>xvii</b>
<b>List of Contributors</b>	<b>xxi</b>
<b>List of Figures</b>	<b>xxiii</b>
<b>List of Tables</b>	<b>xxv</b>
<b>List of Abbreviations</b>	<b>xxvii</b>
<b>Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
<i>Shaun Topham, Paolo Boscolo, Michael Mulquin</i>	
<b>1 Peril on the Road to Utopia – Opportunities and Risks of Infusing Personal Data into the Smart City Ecosystem</b>	<b>5</b>
<i>Haydee S. Sheombar and Joseph V. Sheombar</i>	
1.1 Introduction . . . . .	6
1.2 Broken Promises. . . . .	6
1.2.1 The smart city is finally coming of age . . . . .	6
1.2.2 Is the internet broken?. . . . .	9
1.3 Promising Responses . . . . .	10
1.3.1 European legislation. . . . .	10
1.3.2 Taking back control with data vaults . . . . .	11
1.4 Think! . . . . .	12
1.5 Personal Data Vaults Matter . . . . .	13
1.5.1 Capturing and influencing the citizen journey. . . . .	13
1.5.2 Who will help us? . . . . .	14
1.5.3 Personal benefits of the PDV . . . . .	15

1.6	Utopia or Dystopia? A Scenario Analysis . . . . .	16
1.6.1	Scenario drivers . . . . .	17
1.6.2	Four scenarios . . . . .	19
1.6.3	Strategies to reach Utopia . . . . .	20
1.7	Personal Data: “Fragile, Handle with Care” . . . . .	21
<b>2</b>	<b>The Principal Projects Underpinning This Work</b>	<b>25</b>
	<i>Ana García Garre, John Kaldis and Elena Palmisano</i>	
2.1	Project Overviews . . . . .	25
2.2	DataVaults . . . . .	28
2.3	KRAKEN . . . . .	28
2.4	Safe-DEED . . . . .	29
2.5	DUET Project . . . . .	30
2.6	InteropEHRate . . . . .	31
2.7	RUGGEDISED . . . . .	33
2.8	DataPorts . . . . .	34
2.9	EUHubs4Data . . . . .	34
2.10	i3-MARKET . . . . .	35
2.11	AURORAL . . . . .	36
2.12	REPLICATE . . . . .	37
2.13	PIMCity . . . . .	38
2.14	smashHIT . . . . .	39
2.15	PolicyCloud . . . . .	40
2.16	IRIS: Co-creating Smart and Sustainable Cities . . . . .	42
2.17	SmartEnCity . . . . .	43
2.18	The MyData Global Initiative . . . . .	44
2.19	The SOLID Initiative . . . . .	45
<b>3</b>	<b>Best Practice in the General Use of Data in a City</b>	<b>47</b>
	<i>Annina Autero, Michail Bourmpos, Iván Carrillo Quero, Emanuele Geri, Hervé Groléas, Alisa Jashari, Christina N. Karaberi, María Jose Lopez Osa, Sari Maenpaa, Esben Pejstrup, Elena Palmisano, Fabio Pazzaglia and Minna Sapyska</i>	
3.1	Flanders, Belgium . . . . .	48
3.2	Pilsen, Czech Republic . . . . .	49
3.3	Camden, London, United Kingdom . . . . .	50
3.4	Trikala, Greece . . . . .	52
3.5	Umeå, Sweden . . . . .	52
3.6	Tampere, Finland . . . . .	54
3.7	Cities with Universities: KRAKEN and Students . . . . .	55
3.8	Rotterdam, Netherlands . . . . .	57

3.9	Athens, Greece . . . . .	58
3.10	City Health Organisations and the KRAKEN Health Application. . . . .	59
3.11	Sofia, Bulgaria. . . . .	61
3.12	Piraeus, Greece . . . . .	62
3.13	Grand Lyon (Metropolis of Lyon), France . . . . .	63
3.14	Prato, Italy . . . . .	64
3.15	Eilat, Israel . . . . .	65
3.16	Florence, Italy . . . . .	66
3.17	SmartEnCity: Vitoria-Gasteiz, Spain . . . . .	67
3.18	SmartEnCity: Tartu, Estonia. . . . .	68
3.19	Helsinki, Finland . . . . .	69
3.20	Glasgow, Scotland . . . . .	70
<b>4</b>	<b>Case Studies Involving the Use of Personal Data in a Smart City</b>	<b>71</b>
	<i>Paolo Boscolo, Michail Bourmpos, Ilesh Datani, Ana García Garre, Vincent Keunen, Borja Molina-Ríos, Elena Palmisano and Christina Tsiligkiri</i>	
4.1	MIWenergia in the DataVaults Project . . . . .	72
4.2	Prato's Usage of a Citizen's Personal Data . . . . .	78
4.3	Piraeus's Use of Personal Data . . . . .	82
4.4	Olimpiacos: Interaction with the Fan-Base . . . . .	85
4.5	Olimpiacos: Athletes Sports and Activity Data Sharing. . . . .	87
4.6	Andaman7 Health Application . . . . .	91
4.7	Smart City Graz . . . . .	94
<b>5</b>	<b>The Local Data Economy</b>	<b>97</b>
	<i>Shaun Topham</i>	
5.1	Introduction . . . . .	97
5.2	i3-MARKET. . . . .	101
5.3	AURORAL . . . . .	102
5.4	The smashHIT Project. . . . .	105
5.5	The smashHIT Methodology . . . . .	106
5.6	Conclusion. . . . .	108
<b>6</b>	<b>Technical Components</b>	<b>111</b>
	<i>Sotiris Koussouris and Yury Glikman</i>	
6.1	Introduction . . . . .	111
6.2	Data Owners and Subjects Controlling their Own Data. . . . .	112
6.2.1	User personas . . . . .	113

6.2.2	Direct anonymous attestation (DAA) . . . . .	114
6.2.3	Access control policies . . . . .	115
6.2.4	Data owners consent management . . . . .	116
6.3	Preserving Data Privacy and Data Quality Simultaneously . .	117
6.3.1	Data anonymisation . . . . .	117
6.3.2	Secure data analytic services . . . . .	118
6.3.3	Data management technologies . . . . .	119
6.3.4	Data models and interoperability . . . . .	121
6.3.5	Digital twins for privacy preservation . . . . .	123
6.3.6	Cryptographic solutions for data privacy . . . . .	124
6.3.7	Artificial intelligence threat reporting and response systems . . . . .	125
6.4	Information Delivery on Privacy Metrics and Data Content and Value . . . . .	126
6.4.1	Privacy metrics and risk management and privacy metrics for personal data . . . . .	126
6.4.2	Personal data analytics . . . . .	127
6.4.3	Data valuation . . . . .	128
6.5	Data Platforms. . . . .	128
6.5.1	Secure and trusted data communication channels. . .	129
6.5.2	Immutable ledgers and smart contracts . . . . .	130
6.5.3	Crypto wallets . . . . .	131
6.6	Other Supporting Initiatives . . . . .	132
6.6.1	EUHUBS4DATA . . . . .	132
6.6.2	MyData . . . . .	133
6.6.3	Solid flanders . . . . .	133
6.6.4	Big value data association (BDVA) . . . . .	133
6.7	Looking into the Future . . . . .	134
<b>7</b>	<b>Interoperability and the Minimal Interoperability Mechanisms</b>	<b>135</b>
	<i>Michael Mulquin</i>	
7.1	The Context – The Local Data Sharing Ecosystem . . . . .	135
7.2	Interoperability . . . . .	136
7.3	The European Policy Context . . . . .	138
7.4	Minimal Interoperability Mechanisms . . . . .	140
7.5	The Individual MIMs . . . . .	144
7.5.1	MIM1 context information management . . . . .	144
7.5.2	MIM2 shared data models. . . . .	146
7.5.3	MIM3 finding and using the data . . . . .	146
7.5.4	MIM4 personal data management. . . . .	147



7.5.5	MIM5 fair and transparent AI . . . . .	147
7.5.6	MIM7 geospatial information management. . . . .	148
7.6	MIMs Plus. . . . .	148
<b>8</b>	<b>Health Data in a Smart City</b>	<b>151</b>
	<i>Vincent Keunen</i>	
8.1	Is Health Data Important for a Smart City? . . . . .	151
8.2	The Conflict of Interest . . . . .	151
8.3	Maybe Anonymisation is a Solution? . . . . .	152
8.4	Health of Citizens and Health of the City . . . . .	153
8.5	Health Data Interoperability. . . . .	153
8.5.1	Why is it hard? . . . . .	154
8.5.2	Unstructured data . . . . .	154
8.5.3	Structured data. . . . .	154
8.5.4	Is the situation different in the USA? . . . . .	156
8.6	The InteropEHRate Project . . . . .	157
8.7	Data Ownership and the Distributed Approach . . . . .	157
<b>9</b>	<b>Personal Data Management and MIM4</b>	<b>161</b>
	<i>Michael Mulquin</i>	
9.1	The Fragmented Marketplace . . . . .	161
9.2	MIM4 . . . . .	162
9.2.1	Capabilities . . . . .	163
9.2.2	Requirements . . . . .	165
9.3	The Link with National ID/Citizen Cards. . . . .	166
<b>10</b>	<b>Standards for Citizens</b>	<b>169</b>
	<i>John Ketchell</i>	
10.1	Introduction . . . . .	169
10.2	The Background. . . . .	170
10.3	Citizen Standards in Smart Communities . . . . .	171
10.4	Looking Ahead . . . . .	173
<b>11</b>	<b>Business Models</b>	<b>175</b>
	<i>Shaun Topham</i>	
11.1	Introduction . . . . .	175
11.2	Business Models and Smart Cities . . . . .	177
11.3	Smart City Networks Creating Best Practice Repositories . . . . .	178
11.4	SmartEnCity Project. . . . .	178
11.5	Urban Data Platforms . . . . .	180
11.6	REPLICATE Project. . . . .	180

11.7	IRIS Project . . . . .	181
11.8	IRIS Study and the Smart City Business Model Canvas (SC-BMC). . . . .	181
11.9	REPLICATE Project. . . . .	183
11.10	RUGGEDISED Project . . . . .	185
11.11	Safe-DEED . . . . .	188
11.12	The Safe-DEED Tools. . . . .	189
11.13	DUET Project . . . . .	190
11.14	DataVaults Project. . . . .	191
11.15	Viewpoint from a DataVaults SME’s Perspective . . . . .	192
	11.15.1 Assentian . . . . .	192
	11.15.2 Andaman7 . . . . .	194
11.16	Digital Twins and Business Models . . . . .	194
11.17	Conclusion. . . . .	195
<b>12</b>	<b>(Digital) City Financing Platforms</b>	<b>197</b>
	<i>Juergen Ritzek</i>	
12.1	Introduction . . . . .	197
12.2	Role of Financing Platforms. . . . .	198
12.3	But Who are These Digital Financing Platforms – Or Where are They? . . . . .	199
	12.3.1 Examples of digital financing platforms . . . . .	199
	12.3.2 Credit/loans. . . . .	199
	12.3.3 Re-financing . . . . .	200
	12.3.4 Challenge project pipeline: the chicken and egg problem. . . . .	201
12.4	Conclusion. . . . .	202
<b>13</b>	<b>The Governance of Personal Data for the Public Interest: Research Insights and Recommendations</b>	<b>203</b>
	<i>Marina Micheli</i>	
13.1	Introduction . . . . .	203
13.2	Alternative Models for Data Governance . . . . .	205
13.3	City Administrations’ Access to Personal Data of Public Interest . . . . .	208
13.4	A Few Recommendations for Cities . . . . .	212
<b>14</b>	<b>Data Valuation and Its Applications for Smart Cities</b>	<b>217</b>
	<i>Mihnea Tufiş</i>	
14.1	Introduction . . . . .	217

14.2	Defining the Value of Data . . . . .	220
14.2.1	Data through an economic lens – trading data . . .	220
14.2.2	The price of personal data – a chaotic landscape . . . . .	222
14.2.3	Challenges defining the value of data – beyond financial value . . . . .	225
14.3	The Data Valuation Process . . . . .	228
14.3.1	Data contexts . . . . .	228
14.3.2	Data quality assessment . . . . .	233
14.3.3	Data quality metrics and dimensions . . . . .	234
14.4	Aggregating and Reporting the Value of Data. . . . .	236
14.5	Takeaways for Cities . . . . .	240
<b>15</b>	<b>Does Everything Conform to Legal, Ethical, and Data Protection Principles?</b>	<b>245</b>
	<i>Marina Da Bormida in Cugurra</i>	
15.1	Introduction . . . . .	245
15.2	The Evolving Regulatory Framework Relevant to the Personal Data Sharing Platforms . . . . .	246
15.3	Existing Regulatory Framework. . . . .	248
15.4	The Regulatory Reforms Under Development . . . . .	254
15.5	Main Legal and Ethical Challenges and Technology-enabled Opportunities to Tackle with Them . . . . .	259
15.6	The Need to Avoid Consent Fatigue and to Develop and Use User- and Data-Protection-Friendly User Interface . . .	259
15.7	Risk-based Approach and Risk-Exposure Dashboard . . . .	263
15.8	Personas and Digital Twins . . . . .	264
15.9	Challenges Related to Smart Contracts, the eIDAS Regulation, and the Self-Sovereign Identity. . . . .	270
15.10	DataVaults as a Flagship Initiative for Personal Data Sharing Under User Control and Benefitting All the Actors Involved: Experiences and Lessons Learnt . . . . .	273
15.11	Case Study: Approach and Legal and Ethical Requirements for DataVaults Ethical Policy . . . . .	274
15.11.1	Ethics and data protection impact assessment methodology . . . . .	278
15.12	Conclusion. . . . .	280

<b>16 Data-Driven and Citizens’ Inclusive Smart Cities: Top-Down and Bottom-Up Approaches to Tackle Societal and Climate Challenges</b>	<b>283</b>
<i>Maria Sangiuliano</i>	
16.1 Introduction . . . . .	283
16.2 Sharing and Networking on Citizen Engagement in Europe. Resources and Lessons Learnt from the Citizen Focus Action Cluster of the Smart Cities Marketplace . . . .	284
16.3 Good Practices. Citizen Generated Data to Improve Urban Innovation and Smart Cities Policies. Top-Down and Bottom-Up Approaches. . . . .	288
16.3.1 Harnessing open data for evidence-based urban policies – the Camden and Sofia use-cases. . . . .	289
16.3.2 Crowdsourced data for enhancing safety perception in public space and transport . . . . .	291
16.4 Envisioning the Future of Citizens’ Intelligent Cities and the Role of Citizen Engagement. . . . .	295
<b>17 What Next?</b>	<b>299</b>
<i>Paolo Boscolo, Michael Mulquin and Shaun Topham</i>	
17.1 Moving Towards a European Model for the Data Economy .	299
17.2 The Focus for Follow-up Activity . . . . .	300
17.3 The Story of Data . . . . .	301
17.4 Business Models. . . . .	302
17.5 A “Personal Data-Smart Cities” Group . . . . .	304
17.6 Citizen Engagement . . . . .	306
17.7 Governance . . . . .	307
17.8 Interoperability . . . . .	308
17.9 Legality . . . . .	309
17.10 On the Horizon . . . . .	310
17.11 Contracts to Have Data Plan. . . . .	312
17.12 Concluding Remark . . . . .	312
<b>Index</b>	<b>313</b>
<b>About the Contributors</b>	<b>321</b>
<b>About the Editors</b>	<b>327</b>

---

# Foreword

---

*Johan Bodenkamp, Policy and Programme Officer at the European Commission, and DataVaults Project Officer*

It is widely acknowledged that data has an enormous potential to contribute to better-informed decisions and to create new services and products for the benefit of all.

Every day, we generate an unprecedented amount of data, which is increasingly harvested and used to foster innovation and sustainable economic growth as well as to improve the overall wellbeing of society. Despite the current sanitary, economic, and geopolitical context, studies confirm this positive trend in the data economy. Having reached 440 billion euros in 2021, the latest European Data Market Study<sup>1</sup> estimates that the value of the EU27 data economy will reach 600 billion euros in 2025 and 1 trillion euros in 2030. It is, therefore, not surprising that stakeholders regularly refer to data as the new oil or electricity of our modern society.

The EU is fully committed to setting a framework to help ensure that the benefits of the ongoing data revolution are fully reaped. To this end, the European data strategy<sup>2</sup> aims to make the EU a leader in a data-driven society and to create a single European data space. This space would be a genuine European single market for data, open to data from across the world, in which an almost infinite amount of high-quality personal and non-personal data is secure and can be used in an ethical and trusted way to create value and boost growth, while minimising the environmental footprint related to its use.

To create the right conditions and gradually realise this bold vision for Europe, ambitious legislative, research, innovation, and deployment actions at EU and national level are underway. In particular, the recently adopted Data Governance Act<sup>3</sup> and the proposed Data Act<sup>4</sup> are key EU legislative measures to enhance data availability and use in line with EU rules and values.

Despite this positive trend, the use and sharing of personal data is still limited. This is partly due to hesitations on how to benefit from such sensitive data in a trusted and secure way, ensuring respect of data protection legislation and allowing data subjects and data holders to remain in control of their

data and its use. Fortunately, several EU-funded and national projects, some of which have been actively involved in the preparation of this work, concretely show how this can be done through the use of appropriate secure and privacy-preserving techniques.

This book provides valuable insights into how smart cities could use citizens' personal data in a trusted and ethical way. It makes it an extremely useful source of information for city and municipal staff as well as for other interested stakeholders.

The hope is that it will inspire smart cities to engage more actively in using relevant data, and in particular citizens' personal data, to support important local policy objectives, notably to become climate neutral as quickly as possible.

**Brussels,**  
July 20 2022

---

## Preface

---

This book was produced in order to help grow a data economy in Europe, which reflects European values. It is argued that by adding a citizen's personal data, under their own control, to current and developing use of data in a smart city, a major contribution can be made to realising the ambition of many European cities of becoming carbon-neutral by 2030. And further, to contribute to building a mechanism for replicating the lessons which will be learned as cities utilise personal data and progress towards achieving both their environmental and smart city targets.





---

## Acknowledgements

---



An initiative of the  
**Smart Cities  
Marketplace**

#EUSmartCities



**Funded by  
the European Union**

The 16 projects listed below have all received funding from the European Union's Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme under the respective Grant Agreements indicated.

---



**DataVaults** This project has received funding from the European Union's Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme under grant agreement No 871755



**EUHubs4Data** project has received funding from the European Union's H2020 Research and Innovation Programme under the Grant Agreement No. 951771.



**KRAKEN** is a project which has received funding from the European Union's Horizon 2020 (H2020) research and innovation programme under the Grant Agreement No. 871473.



**DataPorts** project has received funding from the European Union's Horizon 2020 Research and Innovation Programme under Grant Agreement No. 871493.



**Safe-DEED** is a project which has received funding from the European Union's Horizon2020 research and innovation programme under grant agreement No. 825225.



**Replicate** project has received funding from the European Union's Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme under Grant Agreement No. 691735.



**RUGGEDISED** is a project that has received funding from the European Union's Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme under grant agreement No. 731198.



**PIMCity** project has received funding from the European Union Horizon 2020 Research and Innovation programme under the ICT theme: ICT-13-2018-2019 Grant Agreement No. 871370.



**InteropEHRate** project has received funding from the European Union's Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme under grant agreement No. 826106.



**SmashHit** project has received funding from the European Union's Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme under Grant Agreement No. 871477.



**DUET** is a project has received financial support from the European Union's Horizon 2020 Programme under grant agreement No. 870697.



**PolicyCloud** has received funding from the European Union’s Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme under grant agreement No. 870675.



**i3-Market** project is funded by the European Union’s H2020 Research and Innovation Programme under the Grant Agreement No. 871754 (i3-MARKET).



**IRIS** project has received funding from the European Union’s Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme under grant agreement No. 774199.



**Auroral** project has received funding from the European Union’s Horizon 2020 research and Innovation Programme under grant agreement No. 101016854.



**SmartenCity** project has received funding from the European Union’s Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme under grant agreement No. 691883

## Major Cities of Europe<sup>5</sup>



Major Cities of Europe is a European independent organisation of local government CIOs, heads of departments, and policy-makers. They co-operate with academia, public and private organisations focused in that domain. They promote the development of new services for citizens and local businesses. They facilitate exchanges of strategies, experiences, ideas, and

<sup>5</sup> <https://www.majorcities.eu/>

solutions for the use of information and communication technology. Many of their members are also amongst those 100 cities selected by the Commission to lead, in becoming climate-neutral by 2030.

## **Open & Agile Smart Cities<sup>6</sup>**



Open and Agile Smart Cities bring together smart cities and communities worldwide to shape the global market for digital services. It is a network that connects cities and communities worldwide to learn from each other and exchange digital, data-driven solutions based

on minimal interoperability mechanisms (MIMs). They are creating sustainable impact for their member cities by working towards a common technical ground for cities and communities – based on open standards, open APIs, and shared data models. As with Major Cities, many members are seeking to be climate-neutral by 2030.

## **Disclaimer**

The information and views set out in this publication are those of the author(s) and do not necessarily reflect the official opinion of the European Communities. Neither the European Union institutions and bodies nor any person acting on their behalf may be held responsible for the use which may be made of the information contained therein.

We can confirm that there are no conflicts of interest to report.

---

<sup>6</sup> <https://oascities.org/>

---

## List of Contributors

---

**Alisa Jashari**, *Tampere, Finland*

**Ana García Garre**, *MIWenergia, Spain*

**Annina Autero**, *SURE Project, Tampere, Finland*

**Borja Molina-Ríos**, *MIWenergia, Spain*

**Christina N. Karaberi**, *e-trikala – Department of Research and Communication, Trikala, Greece*

**Christina Tsiligkiri**, *Olympiacos SFP, Pireas, Greece*,

**Elena Palmisano**, *Comune di Prato, Italy*

**Elena Palmisano**, *PIN, Prato, Italy*

**Emanuele Geri**, *Information Systems Directorate, City of Florence, Italy*

**Esben Pejstrup**, *ICLEI, Germany*

**Fabio Pazzaglia**, *Information Systems Directorate, City of Florence, Italy*

**Haydee S. Sheombar**, *Founder Kankan\*Tree, Research Affiliate, Erasmus University Rotterdam, Netherlands*

**Hervé Groléas**, *Chief Digital and Information Officer, Grand Lyon, France*

**Ilesh Datani**, *Assentian, Ireland*

**Iván Carrillo Quero**, *ATOS, Spain*,

**John Kaldis**, *Unisystems, Greece*

**John Ketchell**, *European Association for Coordinating Consumer Representation in Standardisation (ANEC)*

**Joseph V. Sheombar**, *Master Student Built Environment, Delft University of Technology, Netherlands*

**Juergen Ritzek**, *EEIP, Brussels, Belgium*

**Maria Sangiuliano**, *Research Director, Smart Venice, Venice, Italy*

**Marina Da Bormida in Cugurra**, *Genoa, Italy*

**Marina Micheli**, *Scientific Project Officer, Digital Economy Unit, European Commission's Joint Research Centre (JRC), Ispra, Italy*

**María Jose Lopez Osa**, *Tecnalia, Spain*

**Michael Mulquin**, *MIMs Ambassador, Open & Agile Smart Cities*

**Michail Bourmpos**, *IT Department, City of Piraeus, Greece*

**Mihnea Tufiş**, *Eurecat Technology Center of Catalunya, Carrer de Bilbao, Barcelona*

**Minna Sapyska**, *Tampere, Finland*

**Paolo Boscolo**, *Comune di Prato, Italy*

**Sari Maenpaa**, *Insta, Finland*

**Shaun Topham**, *Lead, EU Smart Cities Marketplace, "Citizen's Control of Data" Initiative*

**Sotiris Koussouris**, *Suite5, Cyprus*

**Vincent Keunen**, *Andaman7, Belgium*

**Yury Glikman**, *Fraunhofer, Germany*

---

## List of Figures

---

<b>Figure 1.1</b>	A smart city as a bounded “system of systems” . . . .	7
<b>Figure 1.2</b>	The Urban Data Platform, personal data vaults and the smart city ecosystem (based on RUGGEDISED).	8
<b>Figure 1.3</b>	A citizen journey reveals points of sensing and actuation using personal data vaults. . . . .	13
<b>Figure 1.4</b>	Reasons for companies and companies to engage citizens differ (source: RUGGEDISED study). . . .	16
<b>Figure 1.5</b>	What is the impact of personal data on individuals and on the city? . . . . .	17
<b>Figure 1.6</b>	The future impact of personal data (vaults) in terms of four scenarios. . . . .	20
<b>Figure 7.1</b>	Interoperability framework categories. . . . .	137
<b>Figure 7.2</b>	Distance to integrate. . . . .	141
<b>Figure 7.3</b>	Minimum interoperability mechanisms. . . . .	142
<b>Figure 7.4</b>	NIST pivotal points of interoperability. . . . .	143
<b>Figure 8.1</b>	Variety of health data. . . . .	155
<b>Figure 9.1</b>	Shared access. . . . .	166
<b>Figure 13.1</b>	Summary of emerging data governance models. Source: Micheli et al., 2020, p. 6 . . . . .	206
<b>Figure 13.2</b>	Summary of the approaches adopted by local administrations to access private sector data of public interest. . . . .	210
<b>Figure 14.1</b>	Data value network as illustrated by Attard <i>et al.</i> . . .	227
<b>Figure 14.2</b>	Overview of the components of the data valuation process. . . . .	229
<b>Figure 14.3</b>	The aggregation of the scores generated from the different sub-components of the DVC into the data value scorecard. . . . .	238

<b>Figure 14.4</b>	Data value scorecard. A combined view over the general data quality score and its composing data quality metrics. . . . .	238
<b>Figure 14.5</b>	Data value scorecard. A multi-dimensional view of the contextual score. . . . .	239
<b>Figure 17.1</b>	Role for a group of personal data-smart cities. . . . .	306



---

## List of Tables

---

<b>Table 1.1</b>	Highlights of both the negative and the positive impact on the individual and the city.. . . . .	18
<b>Table 7.1</b>	MIMs 1-10. . . . .	145



---

## List of Abbreviations

---

<b>ABAC</b>	Attribute-based access control
<b>ABE</b>	Access-based enumeration
<b>AI</b>	Artificial intelligence
<b>API</b>	Application programming interface
<b>B2G</b>	Business to government
<b>CERTs</b>	Computer emergency response (or readiness) team
<b>CIM</b>	City innovation models
<b>CRUD</b>	Create, read, update, and delete
<b>CSIRT</b>	Computer security incident response team
<b>DGA</b>	Data governance act
<b>DLT</b>	Distributed ledger technology
<b>DMA.</b>	Digital markets act
<b>DQA</b>	Data quality assessment
<b>DQD</b>	Data quality dimension
<b>DQM</b>	Data quality metric
<b>DSA</b>	Digital services act
<b>DVC</b>	Data valuation component
<b>DVP</b>	Data valuation process
<b>EEA</b>	European economic area
<b>eIDAS</b>	Electronic identification, authentication and trust services
<b>EOSC</b>	European open science cloud
<b>ESCO</b>	Energy service company
<b>EU</b>	European union
<b>FAIR</b>	Findable-accessible-interoperable-reusable
<b>GDPR</b>	The general data protection regulation
<b>GIS</b>	Geographic information system
<b>GPS</b>	Global positioning system
<b>HMRC</b>	Her majesty's revenue and customs service
<b>ICT</b>	Information and communications technology
<b>IoT</b>	Internet of things

<b>ITU</b>	International telecommunication union
<b>JRC</b>	Joint research centre
<b>MIM</b>	Minimal interoperability mechanisms
<b>NSO</b>	National statistics organisation
<b>PDV</b>	Personal data vault
<b>PIMS</b>	Privacy information management system
<b>PSI</b>	Public sector information
<b>PV</b>	Photovoltaics
<b>R&amp;D</b>	Research and development
<b>SME</b>	Small- and medium-sized enterprise
<b>SSI</b>	Self-sovereign identity
<b>TPM</b>	Trusted platform module
<b>UDP</b>	Urban data platform
<b>USD</b>	United states dollar
<b>VAT</b>	Value added tax
<b>WIMAX</b>	Worldwide interoperability for microwave access